

Appendix B: Survey Responses

Response 1

1. Name: Sitaram Kunte
2. Year of joining civil services: 1985
3. Educational background: MA Economics, LLB, MSc Public Policy (UK)
4. Year of retirement: 2021
5. Key posts held: Chief Secretary, Maharashtra; Municipal Commissioner, BMC
6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?
Opportunities to serve people; security of job;
7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- Adaptability to changing requirements, for example from command economy to liberalized economy. Working under different ideological dispensations (Communists, Congress, BJP, Regional parties) IAS officers maintained coherence across the country. They remained committed to the Constitution. With OBC reservation, and more women joining the service from different states, IAS is truly representative of Indian society.
8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- Dilution of ethics.
9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?
- Generalist vs Specialist is a false debate. Governance and public policy itself is an area of specialization. There are difficulties in defining specialization: In Civil Aviation sector for example, is a researcher of technical aspect of aeroplanes is a specialist, or a researcher of airports is a specialist, or a researcher of passenger behaviour a specialist?
10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?
- Answer is subject matter specialists plus experts in governance (career bureaucrats) and stakeholders in a synergy can make effective policies.
11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?
- First requirement is to embed ethics more effectively into the psyche of civil service members. Second, regular training to update their knowledge of academic work in the fields of economic, social, political development. Third, create effective platforms for learning from

other countries in various aspects of governance. For example, Mumbai can learn from Istanbul, Shanghai, Hong Kong, Sao Paolo.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 2

1. Name: Suresh Kumar
2. Year of joining civil services: 1968
3. Educational background: B. Tech (Hons) IIT Bombay
4. Year of retirement: 2004 followed by 5 years as Upalokayukta
5. Key posts held:
 - 1-Secretary i/c Rural Development, Agriculture, transport, Social Justice, Women & Children Development
 - 2-Additional Chief Secretary(Home) GOM
 - 3- Upa Lokayukta Maharashtra-2004-2009
6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?

Prestige and career
7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- a. Due to increase in age limit for recruitment there is much geographical and social diversity in the recruitment instead of its being restricted to elite institutions and families. Candidates with various handicaps are able to enter civil services through hard work and repeat attempts. In many ways entry into civil services either through UPSC or PSC has become dream of most educated persons and in many ways can be termed as mass movement
 - b. There is increasing trend of professionals from medical and engineering entering the services
 - c. Young officers are more attuned to problems of citizens
 - d. Officers are more change oriented and take initiatives to bring about change
8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- a. There is greater political interference which could be due to various reasons which need to be investigated.
 - b. Officers are far more ambitious
 - c. There is much greater expansion of posts at senior level with higher vacancies at the field level.
 - d. Officers are afraid to take decisions due to fear of being victimised
9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts

from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

Every specialized field requires both in depth knowledge of the subject as also getting the policy formulated, cleared through the system and implemented which may be difficult for the lateral entrants particularly if they have a short tenure. Majority of regular recruits these days are from technical disciplines with majority being from IITs. Government already has constituted various expert bodies to guide the government in policy making. This includes NITI Aayog which has experts from various disciplines. There is also Prime Minister's Economic council. Other ministries also have directorates and expert bodies to guide and support government. States have constituted their own NITI Aayog like institutions. Even within the system there is enough expertise which the governments need to consult and make use of. Most ministries and departments also have experts as consultants whose number could be increased as per need. Government has already started program of lateral entry whose experience can help in deciding future policy.

10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

- a. Career planning is most important, particularly in the senior positions, so that the officers are posted after considering their experience, training, area of preference and aptitude which can be used in their future assignments. Demand for specialists has arisen due to short term rotations.
- b. Training should be problem solving rather than class room lectures. During middle career officers would be occupying field positions solving real life problems of the citizens such as poor roads, water supply, health, hawkers, slums, encroachments, malnutrition, river clean ups, women's protection, droughts, natural calamities. During training groups may be given specific assignment which they should study in depth and come out with a solution.
- c. Officers may be asked to choose areas of preference say education, economy, defence, health. They should study the subject through books, magazines and seminars and contribute papers even if their current assignment is not in that field. They may be provided assistance for study and may undergo on line tests. Officers may therefore be assessed both for their performance in the present assignment as also in the selected subject matter. This shall ensure that they shall be able to understand the intricacies of the specialized department. Their specialization can be used by other departments also. This along with career planning should help in ensuring specialization in government.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 3

1. Name: Sanjay Ubale

2. Year of joining civil services: 1985
 3. Educational background: B.Sc, MBA, M.Sc
 4. Year of retirement: 2008 (early retirement)
 5. Key posts held: CEO, Zilla Parishad, Collector, Joint Secretary, Adm Reforms, Secretary to CM, Secretary, Special Projects (Mumbai Development)
 6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?
To be of service to the people of India, Improve their quality of life.
 7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?
Civil services provide a great platform to make a difference in the way government affects people, highly qualified and motivated people continue to join the services, there are multiple training opportunities but the most valuable are the ones which one learns on the job. Since we are a democracy, it would be wrong to call political interface as political interference. Civil Servants do have more than adequate protection to resist anything that is not legally or morally right.
 8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- Unfortunately, the recent trend seems to be towards becoming servants of political leaders and not that of the constitution. Sometimes there is a tendency to join the service for the Power it offers and not for the responsibility to serve.
9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

By the very nature of the job, civil service officers are required to arbitrate on conflicting scenarios (such as growth vs environment or growth vs equity). It is therefore important not to have fixed positions which the specialists may have. To me, being a generalist itself is a kind of specialization.

10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

To be a good generalist, one has to have a good understanding of the underlying development discourses. Unfortunately, training at the Academy is weak in this area. There are multiple dimensions of how societies evolve. These have been explored by thinkers such as Adam Smith, Karl Marx, Frederick Engels, Max Weber, Emile Durkheim, Anthony Giddens and so on. Exposure to these thinkers and why we have chosen the path we have (mixed economy for example) needs to be understood or even questioned.

There should be more debates and case studies of what succeeded and what failed. Unfortunately, the Academy has been reduced to an extension of college or university. Meditation, spirituality should be the other dimensions that need to be explored. Obviously, care needs to be taken to see that it does not become dogmatic. Developing abilities to listen and consider others' point of view, being a lifelong learner, inquisitiveness are some aspects that need greater attention.

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

Indian Civil Services is amongst the toughest exams in the world. Also, the process is long which puts off a lot of bright candidates. Shortening this process should be the number one priority. Secondly, the examination has very few opportunities to evaluate the EQ of candidates. It is expected to be done during a personal interview. But that has limitations of time and even the capacity of the interviewer. Integrity is another aspect that gets neglected.

On other aspects such as on the job training, job rotation and the ability to attract talent, the Civil Services fare quite well. However, the intentions may not necessarily be aligned to the larger interests of the Country.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 4

1. Name: S. Rajgopal IAS (Retd)
2. Year of joining civil services: 1957
3. Educational background: BA(Hons), MA(Hist) Delhi Univ, Training in Development organisations in Canberra, Australia.
4. Year of retirement: 1993
5. Key posts held: Spent 10 yrs in the field in Maharashtra, as Assistant Collector, CEO and Collector of District Nagpur; Deputy Secretary Ministry of Defence, MD of Various State Corporations, Development Commissioner SEEPZ Ministry of Commerce, UNESCAP (Industry Division) Bangkok, Industry Secretary Govt of Maharashtra, UNCTAD Geneva, Ethiopian Centre of Technology under UNCTAD, Addis Ababa, Atomic Energy Department GOI as Additional Secretary, Secretary Ministry of Power GOI. Retired as Union Cabinet Secretary, Govt of India.
6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?
To be very frank the primary motivation to join the Civil Service was primarily family pressure and peer pressure. It was the go-to option for all post graduates in those early days of Independent India. The Service offered prestige in the society and an opportunity of permanent service.
7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service? *
As mentioned above initially when we joined the Service it was due to the existing pattern of students seeking employment in IAS and other services of the Government, after studies. However, it is the training given in Metclafe House (IAS training School) that gave an insight into the nature of work in the Service and the opportunities that it provided. The concept of serving the common people of India and the nation came much later. When the Service was constituted, Sardar Patel had said that newly Independent India needs a Steel Frame of India, which would implement the policies framed by the new government with impeccable honesty and integrity while being politically neutral. People's involvement in government started around 1962 with the introduction of Panchayati Raj and IAS officers in the field came into very close contact with people's representatives at the grassroots level. This was a very important transition period for the Service when we can say the Indianization of the Service began in true sense. Since Development became the focus of administration and Judiciary having been separated from the executive the younger generation of Officers joining the service became conscious of the opportunities that it provided to make a difference to the livelihood of common citizens. This is one change that came about that meta morphed the Service into an agent to implement people-oriented policies of the reigning government. Another significant change that has come about in the years that I was in the service, till 1993,

relates to specialization. With increased globalization the higher echelons of administrative machinery got involved in various facets of peoples lives as also economy, health and external interactions. Service officers were posted to various departments that required domain knowledge. A significant change that came about was in the in-situ training in various branches of administration and posting of officers, mostly, became relevant to their field of specialization. Coupled with this domain knowledge and the early people interaction in the field gave an excellent opportunity to the Service officers to serve the Country in a variety of fields. The service became the go to organization of a disciplined set of personnel in times of emergencies and with all its deficiencies has become the real unifier of this diverse nation.

Another important ameliorative change that has come about after I have left service relates to Officers gaining proficiency in Digital literacy. The new officers are now able to grapple with utilizing the Digital tech in improving the public administrative system. For instance the digitization of Land Records in Maharashtra.

8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service? *

Nothing is static in this world and the Service too is continuously evolving. The only thing to ensure is whether this evolutionary trend is in the right direction or not. I will not go into the whole gamut of changes that has come about, but highlight some important ones.

When one discusses the IAS, it must be done in two components. The Service in the first 10 years and the second in various posts in the policy cum implementation phase, i.e. in the higher State or Centre levels.

One of the areas which distinguishes IAS from most other services is the Service officers are trained from the beginning to take decisions at the field level, which are gaining great importance. Right from the beginning of their career they are posted in positions where they are required to be problem solvers and take decisions on the spot while implementing government policies. They have been trained to do this. With improved communications this major asset of Service officers is perhaps changing not for the better. An allied event would be the increased interaction with political organisations. Is this leading to diminishing of the concept of political neutrality of the Service officers on which the service is founded along with impeccable integrity and honesty. This is an evolutionary trend which needs to be watched very closely. As people's officers how does one maintain a certain distance without diminishing the grass roots level interaction is the main question.

9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

This issue has been discussed thoroughly at various forums repeatedly. As I have said earlier in this Survey, Government functions have and are becoming day by day more complex which require specialized domain knowledge. Specialists or domain knowledge experts by their very training, work in silos and no government can afford to make policies based purely on a narrow specialist-based views. Government has to take into consideration overall impact of policy, coordinate different views and "sell" to the public, ultimately for whose benefit the policies are made. Here the government needs the assistance of Generalists who have with their knowledge of grass roots and experience of coordinating different views are able to assist the govt to better formulate policies. The fact that the in-situ training of IAS officers will be of great help cannot be overemphasized. Also, experiments have been done through lateral entry of Specialists and other efforts like at the Centre having an Indian Management service have not succeeded. So, I feel while there is need to have highly specialized personnel where required, the Civil Service should not be diluted. The domain knowledge specialists could certainly be an additionality in the administrative set up. The civil service also must be

now equipped to deal with complex ministries and departments of State and Centre. What changes to be brought for this are as follows:

10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

As I mentioned earlier in the survey, every organization must keep evolving and change according to the changing needs of the administration. Civil Services are no exception. Indeed, in the IAS as also in other services of the country this is happening. Initial Recruitment: Here also there have been efforts to streamline the recruitment process. I have no comments in the way UPSC is handling the process of recruitment, the basic age qualification needs a review. As often stated, it is the initial training in the Academy that shapes young graduates to an officer material through this training. The training modules have been developed after great research and are being continually updated. In the initial stages of the IAS, probationers, as they were called, had to be between the ages of 21-24 years and they were given a maximum of three attempts to qualify. The reason was that these are the best ages to mould young minds. Owing to affirmative action, that are essential, the age limits now are different. It is necessary, to review this aspect keeping in mind both the requirements of affirmative action as well as the absorptive capacity of the Probationer. In-Situ Training: Training is an essential requirement of any evolutionary process. During the early years of the Service this was done through random efforts and there was no institutional mechanism for it. I have noticed that many states now have training institutes but none specifically to train and prepare IAS at various levels of higher administration. An IAS officer spends around 35 years in Service and in the Second stage of their career they need to be trained in domain specific fields, as also a refresher at the generalist level. What I mean is, after the stint in the field the officer should be given a domain training. An officer's aptitude should be evaluated during the field service and specialized institutions should be selected to impart the training. For instance, if an officer shows an inclination to numbers, he could be given a management diploma or degree in one of the recognized institutions. Similarly for various other facets of administration. This will help officers immensely as they will gain some domain knowledge and make them competent to interact with various domain specialists. This training is very important for an officer's second stage in his career. Posting: Authorities involved in posting of officers should take care that they are posted specially in the second stage of their career, as per their chosen domain, with a fixed tenure. This is where there is need to institutionalize the posting mechanism. Composition: During my years in the service every effort was made to see that IAS officers in a State comprised of 50% from outside the State and remaining from the State. This was done to maintain the all-India character of the Service. However, I am told, this has been affected adversely lately. This must be amended. IAS is a service constituted under the Indian Constitution with certain protections, and as per vision of Sardar, this was done not only to give an impeccably honest and high integrity organization which can function without fear because of protection guaranteed by the Constitution. The protection of late has been impaired and many a times political neutrality has been affected. This is one organization that the government has with it and construed as per the requirements of our country. We should not compare with other countries. India is a unique amalgamation of cultures, languages, local cultural differences. The Service barring exceptions has served the nation well. IAS needs some fine tuning but the basic character as envisaged in the Constitution and Sardar Patel need not and should not be disturbed.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 5

1. Name:
2. Year of joining civil services: 1988
3. Educational background: MBBS
4. Year of retirement: 2022
5. Key posts held: ACS GAD (AR) at retirement
6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?

For public service; one's decisions can make positive impact on a large section of the Society

7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

It has become more inclusive, shed its elitist nature to a large extent, and become more amenable to people

8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

Overall ethos of values and objectivity

9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

District Administrators cannot be specialist; by very nature of work they need to be generalist. But, yes, there should be conscious efforts to specialize them in some sectors by mid-career education, and postings in a particular sector.

10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

The way in which the Civil Service is conceived is that Civil Servants first gather strong field experience and then they contribute at State Government and Central Government level in policy making. Unless the very fundamental nature of the service is changed, specialist recruitment seems difficult. Thus, option as stated above is feasible

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

One cannot isolate civil service from the system within which it operates. Thus, improvement of both the civil service and the system is a continuous process, like RTI, RTS, Good Governance discourse, Lokayukta Act etc .

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 6

1. Name: Ajit Kumar Jain
2. Year of joining civil services: 1982
3. Educational background: Masters in Political Science and Development Administration
4. Year of retirement: 2014

5. Key posts held:

Addl. Chief Secretary to Chief Minister of Maharashtra
Principal Secretary Water Supply and Sanitation
Addl. Commissioner BMC
State Excise commissioner
Collector
CEO Zilla Parishad

6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?

Prestigious Service with Opportunities to make a difference in the lives of the people

7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

Significant application of information technology, Rights based legislations, and transparency and direct accountability to the citizens.

8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

The growing compromising attitude of the Civil Servants for personal benefits.

9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

There is good representation of different disciplines in the service. Moreover, there has been a practice for quite some time to put technical officers on the non- cadre posts, and engage consultants. The same may be continued. The cadre posts should however be filled up from the permanent officers, based on their qualifications, and inclination to different sectors.

10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

Already many changes have occurred in the training of the IAS officers, at the time of entry and across different phases of service. The choice may be given to them to specialize and serve in a few particular sectors.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 7

1. Name: b n makhija

2. Year of joining civil services:1964

3. Educational background: MCom

4. Year of retirement:1997

5. Key posts held:Collector, CEO, Div Commr.,Municipal administrator, Addl Scy, Advisor planning commissioner.

6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?

A decent job for a decent living.

7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

Democratic decentralization taking root, coarsening of the political class, demoralization of the services, some heartening exceptions on both sides.

8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

Generalists are alright but they must retrain continually to become specialists in public admn.

10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

That's too much of a mouthful. But briefly, attempts need to be made to keep the flame alive in the idealists, to weed out the corrupt, incentivize the performers and show the door to the non performers.:That is too wide a question to admit of a brief reply.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 8

Questionnaire on the Evolution of the Civil Services and Thoughts on Changes Required

1. Name: Satish Tripathi
2. Year of joining civil services: 1972
3. Educational background: MSC physics
4. Year of retirement: 2008
5. Key posts held: Secretary Energy, Secretary Forests, & Environment Secretary Civil Supplies, Secretary Relief and rehabilitation, Secretary General Administrator etc.
6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?

To be able to serve people

To see functioning of the Government at close quarters.

To be a part of policy and decision-making; to plan execute and implement projects of development.

To be able to extend outreach Government welfare programs to people

7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

Unlike its predecessor ICS, IAS now, has a more humane and people-friendly face. Members of Public have easy access to government offices and can air their grievances before the highest authorities easily. IAS is no longer an

elite service confined to children from influential families. There is fair a representation from rural areas and rural development programs have become people oriented and need based.

8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service? *

The sense of selfless service is missing. Dithering and delay in decision making is impacting quality of service. The level of corruption is on the rise; officers have become more acquisitive and self-serving. The will to resist undue pressure is missing and quite a few officers have become 'yes men' of ministers. Inefficiency, procrastination and passing the buck has become the order of the day.

9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

The answer is 'NO' Experts from other areas have proved total failure after being drafted into government service. The culture, the opportunity for freedom of action is quite different for the two sets of offices. People coming from other fields find the atmosphere in government officers stifling and unfriendly. They fail to command respect of their peers and juniors. A generalist IAS officer is capable of performing a Govt. job as efficiently as a specialist, and

therefore there is no need for parallel entry of officers from private organisations.

10. If your answer to qs. 7 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

There is a general degradation of morals and values in the society and IAS is no exception. It is true that some of the officers join the service for the lure of making fast bucks. It is necessary that such tendencies are curbed with a heavy hand. The code of conduct for officers should provide for summary punishment for conduct not appropriate to the expected standard of behaviour. Similarly, there is a need for a code of conduct for people's representatives while dealing with officers. An officer must be guaranteed dignity and respect and any attempt by a superior political appointee to humiliate or ride roughshod over an officer's opinion should be contained. Officers should be allowed to act freely and according to their best judgment without fear or favour. The course curriculum at the training academy must undergo an overhaul so that the training is in tune with the requirements of the job.

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

There is no gain saying the fact that IAS no longer attracts the best talent because of so many other equally attractive careers available. However, with the vast pool of bright people available in the country, there is no dearth of capable

people opting for the service. What is worrying, however is the fact that entry into IAS has become the ultimate goal for some. A sense of smugness sets into some who resist change and become status quait and start believing that they are there to govern and not serve. Such narrow attitudes and perceptions need to be corrected during the period spent at the training academy and through repeated orientation courses in cognitive behaviour.

The charm of the service is in its generality and there is no need to separate “Specialists” from Generalists” once an officer is inducted in the service. Every officer should have a level playing field so that he / she can aspire for any job in the service. The way confidential reports are written leaves too much of discretion with the reporting officers who at times act with bias. There should be a system to punish the erring reporting officer so that these reports so vital in career progression are fair and serve to give proper feedback to this officer.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 9

Questionnaire on the Evolution of the Civil Services and Thoughts on Changes Required

1. Name: SUBHASH LALLA
2. Year of joining civil services: 1977
3. Educational background: B.E.; LL.B.
4. Year of retirement: 2006
5. Key posts held: Distt. Collector Commissioner Co-op.,
P. Secretary to S.W. & Urban Dev. Dep't.
P. Secretary to Chief Minister of Maharashtra.
6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?
Pl. see point- (6) Annexure.
7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- Pl. see pt (7) in Annexure.
8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- Pl. see pt (8) in Annexure.
9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?
- Pl. see point- (9) in Annexure.
10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?
- Pl. see point- (10) in Annexure.
11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?
- Pl. see pt- (11) in Annexure.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Point (6) - It gave status in society as there were not many options available in PVT. Sector during those years. Govt. Service was the best available option and I.A.S. was and is on top in services.

Point (7) - Training modules 4 weeks & 1 week at premier institutes were added to keep I.A.S. officers updated with changes that is taking place in PVT. Sector.

- R.T.I Act, Independent Election commissions at state and Centre level were established to bring transparency in administration.

Point (8) - Political interference in administration; Corrupt leaders getting elected for higher posts, Criminalisation in politics are some of these quite apparent.

Point (9) - It is true that times have changed and more and more specific competence have come in different sectors/fields. The changes are coming too fast particularly after I.T. revolution and Govt. sectors have to keep pace with the changes around and take advantage of it in its deliveries

-- of services. Experts/consultants are available and the solution is to hire them as and when required but framing policies can't be left to them as they may come with agenda of their own from particular part players. Hence control and decision making can't be left to part-time experts/consultants and hence role of I.A.S. is difficult as they have to keep pace with developments around.

(10) making appropriate changes in hiring experts/consultants as & when required by compensating them for the services rendered by them and also keep I.A.S. officers updated with the latest by keeping their background qualifications in certain sectors and appointing them accordingly.

(11) Dividing the cadre into different fixed of specialisation at initial stages and posting them on posts connected with the sector will make them more competent to accept challenges of changes with sector. Recruitment as such will continue to attract best intellectuals into I.A.S. as in present practice.

Response 10

Questionnaire on the Evolution of the Civil Services and Thoughts on Changes Required

1. Name: **DR.JAIRAJ MORESHWAR PHATAK**
2. Year of joining civil services: **I.A.S. 1978**
3. Educational background:
M.Sc.Physics IIT Bombay, before joining the service. MPA Kennedy School of Harvard University 1995, Ph.D 2004
4. Year of retirement: **2015**
5. Key posts held:

Municipal Commissioner Mumbai, Chairman REC, Government of India & Collector of Nagpur

6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?

My father started his career as a lawyer and went to become Civil Judge and JMFC 1st Class. He found that IAS Officers hold important positions at young age. He did not want me to go abroad permanently. So he encouraged me to appear for the IAS.

7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

Over the years, service has become more people oriented. The officers try to solve genuine problems of the people . Officers have become also more responsive to be elected representatives of the people. The focus of Officers has become economic growth instead of some irrelevant targets such as it has night halts & inspections.

8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*

Over the years many officers are getting aligned to powerful politicians. The politicians themselves do not have higher standard of integrity and these officers working with them follow them. There is also a tendency to settle scores with opponents by using of agencies such as CBI, ED and Income Tax. Sometimes innocent officers also suffer from these agencies.

9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?

It is true that on some posts we require specialists since IAS officers do not understand technical issues in a specialized sector. Even in the past officers such as Montek Singh Ahluwalia, Lav Raj Kumar and Shri Vijay Kelkar were brought for specific competences. However, such specialists need to be used in their expertise. Otherwise there can be personal favourites such as an Aircraft Pilot who was appointed as ' Cabinet Secretary' (Super Chief Secretary) in one of the States.

Dr. Phatak

10. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?

There are many impediments. Individual posts need to be ear-marked for technical experts and experts can be brought in through transparent procedure of selection if they show that they are better than competing I.A.S. Officers.

11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?

The age limit of 30 years and six attempts for the UPSC examination has made many young students waste many years to attempt the Civil Services examination. Perhaps the age limit can be 30 and number of attempts can be brought down to 3 only. It is also found that the All India Service officers are reluctant to go on deputation to Government of India, as their children are in crucial stages of education. After 10 to 15 years of working in the States, IAS officers may be given a choice for permanent accreditation to GOI so that the officers can decide whether to work accredit with the center or for the States. The selection of officers for Government of India posts may be strictly in terms of the expertise for sound policy making. Such permanent absorption does exist in Intelligent Bureau for the Indian Police Service officers.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Pratik
(Jaiy' Pratik)

Response 11

Questionnaire on the Evolution of the Civil Services and Thoughts on Changes Required

1. Name: NAVIN KUMAR
2. Year of joining civil services: JOINED IAS (INDIAN ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICE) IN 1969
3. Educational background: M.Sc. Physics from Allahabad University in 1966
4. Year of retirement: 2006
5. Key posts held: Additional Chief Secretary, Government of Maharashtra, Secretary to Goyt in Forest Department, Dairy Commissioner, Director of Sugar Maharashtra.
6. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- Introduction of Computerisation from the year 1983
- Transition to Marathi from English as the main language of Administration .
- Communication improved tremendously due to cell phones.
- Right to Information Act implemented. Right to services implemented.
7. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service? * None
8. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?
- Top Management has to be geralist to comprehend the needs of the common people. Advisors can be specialists wherever necessary. This method is already being followed.
9. If your answer to qs. 9 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?
10. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?
- By and Large the civil services are working very satisfactorily. It is seen in the holding of elections, census, regularly. The country has now become the 5th largest economy. The officers are selected Union Public Service Commission very impartially.

1. M. Subramanian IAS (RETD)

Former Agriculture Secretary to Govt. of India

Address : Flat 103, 1st Floor, Samudra Manthan,
Juhu Versova Link Road, Mumbai - 400053

Maharashtra, India.

2. 1954 IAS Batch.

3. B.Sc. (Hons). Physics.

Later in 1970s Masters in Financial Mgt.

4. Retired in 1986

5. Some key postings:

1. Supt/Dy Dir. Land Records

2. Collector Jalgaon / Nagpur.

3. CEO Zila Parishad Kolhapur.

4. Dy Secy (Agri) GOI - part of core group for green revolution.

5. Transport Commissioner (Mah).

6. Industries Commr / Secy Industries & Labour (Mah.)

7. Secy (Animal Husbandry / Dairy Devt / Fisheries (Mah))

8. Secy (Cooperation) Mah.

9. Addl. Secy Rural Devt. GOI.

10. Secy (Civil Supplies) GOI.

11. Secy (Agri). GOI.

6. My motivations:

As a village boy living in days where we had no electricity, no drinking water supply, no sanitation/drainage, the primary motive was to get the family into a better living standard. More important motivation was to serve the rural folk (I was one amongst them) who were never given proper services by the admin. Hoped that in joining the IAS I can bring about a change in the mindset of public servants. (P.T.O)

I was 18 when India gained independence and I was a follower of Gandhian ideals where the village devt. was the foundation of national progress. I believed I can play a key role in this by joining the IAS. I was lucky in my postings which were related to agriculture / rural devt., except for my experience in industries in Maharashtra (which helped me to bring technology in the growth of village / small / cottage industries (including khadi). My degree in financial mgt. was also helpful in showing the financial / social returns from the investment made in rural India. I am happy to have authored the Rural Landless Employment guarantee scheme for the country (which is still the bulwark of employment for the rural poor).

7. Positive changes:

- a) Over the decades greater emphasis has been given to a decentralised admin and panchayati raj (with all its defects) has come to stay. Local self govt is part of my Gandhian ideology.
- b) Water & soil management have been given ~~the~~ more importance. Merely focussing on inputs & outputs in agriculture is not enough without preserving the soil texture and providing assured water supply.
- c) Poverty alleviation has come into focus with social indicators to determine the improvement in the living standards of rural poor.

M. Subramanian IAS (RETD)

Former Agriculture Secretary to Govt. of India

Address : Flat 103, 1st Floor, Samudra Manthan,
Juhu Versova Link Road, Mumbai - 400053
Maharashtra, India

3 -

(d) Access to education and public health has improved albeit we have miles to go.

(e) The country has as a whole shown phenomenal progress in which the role of the civil service is a vital element.

8. Negative Changes:

1. Rural India was always under-represented in the I.A.S. This trend has not changed. The urban elite culture still persists. The training environment in Mussoorie only accentuates it.
 2. The attraction of Finance/Industries/Commerce etc for the IAS continues. The best talent is not being sent to work for agriculture rural devt.
 3. Political support was available for good governance when I joined. At the time of my retirement, corruption in politics had increased and political support for good governance had diminished.
- (P.T.O)

From prepage - 4 -

9. Specialists should continue to work in their own field. Their talent must not be wasted by converting them into a multidisciplinary IAS officer. The system should enable specialists and civil servants to work as a team for every project.

Lateral entry to IAS is available to civil servants from other depts. It can be extended to academics and professionals. But lateral entry of private sector executives to IAS will harm the nation for 2 reasons: They will be lacking in motives of public service. They may also bring corruption into a system already plagued by corruption.

10. The major impediments lie in ideology and background. Urban elitism and capitalist tendencies are progressively penetrating the civil services. My fear is the dedication to poverty alleviation and provision of efficient-affordable services to rural India will soon disappear. It is unfortunate that

M. Subramanian IAS (RETD)

Former Agriculture Secretary to Govt. of India

Address : Flat 103, 1st Floor, Samudra Manthan,
Juhu Versova Link Road, Mumbai - 400053
Maharashtra, India

-5-

the efficient delivery systems that are designed for industry & commerce are not provided for purposes of giving affordable services needed in rural India.

For this we need a sea change in the School Education System that moulds IAS officers of the future. Also in the training of IAS officers. Like their attachment to the Army, why are not IAS officers attached to NAOs in backward and tribal areas as part of their training? In short more emphasis on ethical behaviour must exist in education and training the nation's youth. How else can motivation for dedicated service be created?

H. Job rotation already exists. It must continue as multidisciplinary exposure is the real strength of the I.A.S. (PTO)

From prepage - 6 -

An officer's dedication must persist regardless of political interference or working environment or career opportunities & compensation etc. All expectations can't be fulfilled in a human world. If you are really dedicated, these excuses won't survive. Lastly training must be designed to mould the young officers to be dedicated civil servants. For this purpose

Mussoorie is the wrong place. Academy must move to a metro city where they can interact with senior officers and go into the field to gain hands on experience. The same applies to the training in the districts. Unless the officers are actually made to work as talatis & circle officers, they will never learn the nitty gritty of rural admin. Did not the Ford founder ask his son to start work from the level of motor mechanic? The idea of the IAS as a Kusti job with money and power has to go. It has to become the Indian Seva Service. Service to the common man is service to the Nation.,
→X→X→

Response 13

Questionnaire on the Evolution of the Civil Services and Thoughts on Changes Required

1. Name: GOVIND SWARUP
2. Year of joining civil services: 1971
3. Educational background: M.A. (Political Science) Allahabad University
4. Year of retirement: 2006
5. Key posts held: CEO Z.P. Jalgaon, Collector Nashik, Administrator Thane Municipal Corporation, Dy Commissioner Aurangabad, Secretaries to the GAD, Planning, Forest, Housing, Culture & Textiles (GOI) M.D. Pimpri City
6. What were your primary motivations in seeking a career in the civil services?
An opportunity to do constructive contribution to the society and the Nation
7. What positive changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- The most positive change is inclusion of the people from rural and poor background, more dedication and lot of people from technical background.
8. What negative changes did you observe in the civil services during your years of service?*
- The negative change is more alignment of politicians and the bureaucrats and also serving of self interest.
9. It is sometimes argued that in today's complex world we need more specialists rather than generalists to form government policy more effectively. Should the Civil Services have more experts from industry and other areas who are brought in for specific competencies as opposed to only permanent career officers?
- Generalists are important because they have a broad experience and are aware of ground realities. Technocrats at times tend to have narrow outlook limited to their specialisation and suffer with internal defections.
10. If your answer to qs. 7 is Yes, what are the impediments to achieving this or what needs to be done to make this happen?
- Recruitment has to be more broad based and there has to be more empowerment for achievements. Positivity has to be rewarded and negativity penalised.
11. What changes, if any, are required in the Civil Services to make them more effective? What suggestions would you have in terms of either the nature of intake, structure of the services, training, rotation in jobs, or any other facets?
- While recruiting more emphasis on commitment and dedication plus the positive attitude should be judged. Similarly rules should be for more result orientation and failures to be treated as part of experiments.

* e.g. in quality of incoming officers, level and quality of training provided, suitability of training and talent with the demands of the job, political interference, career planning, working environment, compensation (absolute and relative to alternative career opportunities), freedom to operate, or any other areas

Response 14

1. CHITRAKAL ZUTSHI
2. 1971
3. POST GRADUATE IN SOCIOLOGY.
4. 2009
5. a) ACS, HOME.
b) PS, FINANCE
c) COLLECTOR, PUNE.
d) ELECTRICITY OMBUDSMAN, NAGPUR.
6. MOTIVATION WAS TO GAIN A PLACE OF RESPECT IN SOCIETY AND TO DO GOOD FOR THE PEOPLE
7. TRAINING IS JOB ORIENTED + OFFICERS ARE TRYING TO BECOME DOMAIN EXPERTS
8. TOO MUCH OF POLITICIZATION & CORRUPTION

9 GENERALIST ADMINISTRATORS ARE
BEST SUITED TO FORM GOVT
POLICY. THE ADVICE OF
EXPERTS IS AVAILABLE TO
THEM.

10 —

11. CHARACTER BUILDING IS
REQUIRED. THE INTERVIEW PANEL
SHOULD BE ABLE TO PICK UP
CANDIDATES WITH INDEPENDENT
VIEWS. AND THE AGE OF
RECRUITMENT NEEDS TO BE
LOWERED AND BROUGHT TO
THE LEVELS OF THE 1960s + 70s.